

Signs of Grace in a Graceless World

The Charismatic Structure of the Church in Trinitarian Perspective

Frank D. Macchia
Vanguard University

THE CHARISMATIC STRUCTURE OF THE CHURCH IN A GRACELESS WORLD

We live in a graceless world. This statement is one-sided but true nevertheless. Though natural life is graced by God and lives from God (e.g., Acts 17:24-25), it often confronts us as ambiguous, especially when grace seems eclipsed by darkness. This ambiguity is especially evident in the realm of social relationships. As Christopher Lasch has noted in, *Haven in a Heartless World*, the structures of capitalist society have come increasingly to dominate even the life of the family, which has served traditionally and ideally as a “haven” in the midst of an impersonal world.¹ Families are losing their role as “haven” and are becoming less and less influential in imparting values, caring for their young and elderly, and upholding human dignity and worth. Family members share little in common, since they spend most of their time serving different institutional interests. Moreover, familial relationships often seem as graceless as the institutions that have influenced them. For example, seemingly ungrateful children are sometimes reminded of the need to obey in return for the shelter, food, clothing and other “services” granted by parents as providers, as though parenting can be reduced to the provision of various goods and services!

And the media is quick to sell the illusion that a haven may yet be found through increased purchasing power. Marketing experts have done sufficient research to know what kind of consumers to make of us and how to instruct us effectively in the task of measuring one’s attainment of personal worth by the level of consumption achieved. Socialist societies have not historically been more liberating, since one in such contexts was generally judged by how

well he or she could “produce” for the state or, ideally, the “common good.” Indeed, the principalities and powers of human social life have sought to make us into one-dimensional beings fit for a particular social function and disposable if shown to be unfit for use. A certain social worth is only granted to those who benefit most from a complex interplay of values shaped by the dominant culture and connected to such factors as race, gender, class, and physical or mental capabilities.

Connected to these social dynamics is that to which Paul Tillich referred as a universal “Angst” or dread that takes many forms, spanning such concerns as death, guilt, and meaninglessness.² Perhaps “gracelessness” should be added to this list in the light of our discussion above. We live in an increasingly “graceless” world.³ Throughout the myriad of relationships that extend our sense of self into the world, we teeter between threats of ruthless domination and cowardly assimilation. People, even entire peoples, are treated as means to some social end. We seem bound by flesh in the sense of being bound by this “fallen” situation. Language, culture, and social structures shape and maintain our alienation from self and others. In such a situation, flesh cries for Spirit and liberty, to taste that to which the New Testament refers under the loaded term, “grace.” Where can this grace be found?

It should be found centrally in the church as the locus of the Spirit of Christ in the world. This affirmation of the church as the chief context of redeeming grace is not meant to eclipse the nature of the church as a fallen reality. Martin Luther once called the church the “infirmary of the sick.”⁴ This is true, however, not only because we are wounded sinners, but also because we are wounded healers, gifted to heal and to strengthen one another by helping each other in unique ways to be receptive to the grace of God. The church should pulsate with ever-increasing gifts of helps and edification toward this end. Essential to the church’s kerygmatic and sacramental life, therefore, is the church’s *charismatic structure*. What is this “charismatic structure” precisely?

Hans Küng popularized the notion of the “charismatic structure of the church” in his classic, *The Church*, where he made it the overall context in which the church’s gifts of oversight are to be discussed.⁵ He noted that juridical thinking is mistrustful of movements of the free Spirit of God for fear of a non-regimented enthusiasm. The tendency has been to “sacramentalize or make uniform the charism, and hence the workings of the Spirit.”⁶ The result is a clericalism in which the notion of *charism* is overwhelmingly discussed in the

context of ordained ministry. Neglected are the richness, variety, and exuberance of spiritual gifts as pictured in such texts as 1 Corinthians chapters 12 to 14 and exercised throughout the lives of “ordinary” Christians.

Küng wished to reverse the historic trend toward clericalism. Rather than subsume *charism* under church office, Küng thus wished to do the opposite, namely, subsume office beneath *charism*.⁷ Since *charisms* are universally exercised by all as everyone in the church is called and commissioned to serve as bearers of the Spirit, the *charisms* are not peripheral but are rather essential and central elements of the church. Küng concludes that the charismatic structure of the church “*includes but goes far beyond the hierarchical structure of the church.*”⁸ As we will note, Küng does not deny the unique role played by those who exercise the *charism* of oversight, but he places both gifts of oversight and other giftings within an overarching concept of the church as a fellowship of faith in which all members (including ordained clergy) as bearers of the Spirit are gifted to bless one another. For Küng, “the church must be seen first as a fellowship of faith and only in this light can ecclesiastical office be properly understood.”⁹

The Pentecostal and Charismatic churches that are becoming so visible globally and are arguably changing the face of Christendom in the world have traditionally stressed the charismatic structure of the church as essential to the strength of the church’s fellowship and witness. The practical result of elevating the church’s charismatic structure to prominence is the strong admonition that the people of God not fall short of any gift while waiting for the Lord’s return (1 Cor. 1:9). Everyone has a gift and a call to serve others with their gift(s). Everyone is to be involved so that the church can “build itself up in love” (Eph. 4:16). Tied to this admonition is a vision of the church as an interactive fellowship, filled with the Spirit in order to “speak to one another with Psalms, hymns, and spiritual songs” (Eph. 5:18-19). In the church we “submit to one another out of reverence to Christ” (Eph. 5:21) as we speak the truth in love to one another (Eph. 4:15). In the process, the charismatic structure of the church is dynamic, interactive and developing. John Koenig rightly stated that the church is to be a “gift-evoking” fellowship.¹⁰ As such a fellowship, the church encourages relationships that edify and build up, relationships that are grace filled and directed. *Through its charismatic structure, the church expands the capacity of its members to receive grace from God via proclamation and sacrament and enhances the church’s ability to show forth relational signs of grace in an increasingly graceless world.*

As Miroslav Volf has shown, part of the process of becoming a gift-evoking fellowship is to appreciate the deeper and broader insight into the nature of the church as an interactive communion or *koinonia* as well as the source of our communion *in God*.¹¹ In its life as a *communio sanctorum*, the church is in the image of the Trinity as a fellowship of Father, Son, and Spirit. It is not coincidental that the two passages that deal most prominently with spiritual gifts in the New Testament, 1 Corinthians 12 and Ephesians 4, speak of *God as Triune*, even though the contexts of these texts do not require it (1 Cor. 12:4-6; Eph. 4:4-6). From early on, the church saw the source of their corporate life fundamentally in the story of Jesus, which was Trinitarian in structure. The church that pulsates interactively with gifts of new life cannot help but connect this new life with the life of God as Father, Son, and Spirit. It is thus fitting to explore the Trinitarian context for the church's charismatic structure a bit further.

THE TRINITARIAN CONTEXT OF THE CHURCH'S CHARISMATIC STRUCTURE

Christ bestowed the Spirit upon the church from the ultimate context of his loving communion with the Father. Jesus' life in the Spirit was actually a drama played out from his loving relationship with the Father. The Father lavishly bestowed the Spirit on the Son to show forth his love and good pleasure in the Son (Matt. 3:16-17; John 3:34). The Son responded in the Spirit by showing uncompromising devotion to the Father (Matt. 4:1f), even to the point of obedient death on the cross (Heb. 9:14; Phil. 2:8). In response to the Son, the Father raised him from the dead "according to the Spirit of holiness" (Rom. 1:4; Phil. 2:9). In the story of Jesus, as well as correspondingly in God, the Spirit is the *bond of love* between the Father and the Son. When Jesus bestowed the Spirit upon the church, he showed that his loving communion with the Father was not closed but open to others. The Spirit poured out from this love is also that bond between us and God (Rom. 5:5).

Why does the Trinitarian drama of redemption played out in the story of Jesus lead to the establishment of the church? The Trinitarian drama in the story of Jesus has to do with loving communion or a *mutual* participation in life (*koinonia*). Thus, redemption through the mutual

working of Word and Spirit brings about a loving and gracious *fellowship* as the locus of witness and new life. The church is thus not an accident of history nor is it supplemental to the drama of redemption. The fellowship of the church is vital to the redemption of the world since God wills that we comprehend “with all the saints” the depth of the love of Christ (Eph. 3:18). The charismatic structure of the church facilitates the *koinonia* at work in this *mutual* comprehension of Christ’s love.

The church as *koinonia* thus has a charismatic structure that is essential to its vitality and effectiveness. The church as participant in the fellowship of the Father and the Son through the Spirit is diversely gifted in a way that is *relational, interactive, and governed by the love of God*.¹² In the light of the church’s charismatic structure, the church’s *koinonia* is not uniform, one-dimensional, generic, or hierarchical. It is colorfully diverse, complex, unique, and mutually interactive. The outpouring of the Spirit is also not generic nor monolithic but rather particularistic and diverse.¹³ Paul notes that we exercise gifts “according to the grace given to us” (Rom. 12:6), implying that grace is experienced in ways unique and particular to a person’s gifting. The outpouring of the Spirit at Pentecost proliferates among the people of God in the specific form of diverse gifts so that all of the people of God can become unique channels of grace to one another in the midst of a world characterized to a significant degree by graceless relationships. Spiritual gifts are the specific means by which the church becomes a graced community ever more faithful to its ministry and its mission as it becomes ever more faithful to Christ. Through the cultivation of spiritual gifts, the church grows toward the “full stature of Christ” in the world (Eph. 4:13).

Enriched by the church’s charismatic structure, the church’s *koinonia* is interactive and mutually edifying.¹⁴ Discernment guides prophecy, interpretation explains tongues, wisdom guides the proper use of knowledge, evangelism points those who are healed to the good news to which the healing bears witness, faith keeps scholarship loyal to the proclamation of the church and scholarship keeps faith open up to critical questions (etc., etc.). In spiritual gifts, church members interact in ways that are grace-filled and edifying. *Since the church is a fellowship of faith, hope, and love, its relational and interactive charismatic structure is essential and fundamental to its vitality and effectiveness.*

This charismatic structure is fluid and relational, because spiritual gifts are graced ways of relating to each other that depend on the will of the Spirit at work among us and the

contextual needs of the ministry of the Word of God (1 Cor. 12:11). Spiritual gifts signify and facilitate the graced relationships necessary to expand our capacities to receive and apply the grace that comes to us through word and sacrament. We can take this to mean that the *charismata* (spiritual gifts) represent the formation of edifying relationships in the church that inspire us in many different and unique ways to bear one another's burdens, affirm one another's dignity and worth before God, and build one another up in Christ. *Spiritual gifts open the church to God's grace and show forth signs of this grace in a graceless world.*

Furthermore, the Trinitarian context for the church's charismatic structure also means that the *charismata* cannot be hijacked by enthusiasts who detach the church from its christological foundation nor can the church's pneumatological constitution be played off against its christological foundation, or vice versa. There is no Spirit without Word nor Word without Spirit. Both Spirit and Word are the "left and right hands" of the Father (Irenaeus). In the beginning, God spoke the creation into being, but that spoken word was carried on the very breath of God (Gen. 1:1-3). In Ezekiel 37, hopeless Israel was promised that the word of prophecy would join with the winds of the Spirit to raise Israel up from the grave in order to make it into a living nation for God.

This outpouring of the Spirit was also attached to the future coming of the Messiah (Isa. 61:1-3). When the Son of God was born as the Word of the Father (John 1:1-18), he was conceived in the virgin Mary through the "hovering" of the Spirit in a way similar to the hovering of the Spirit at the creation (Luke 1:35; Gen. 1:2). Jesus' entire life, death, and resurrection were part of a journey in the Spirit by which Jesus was taken up into the loving communion mediated by the Spirit between the Father and the Son. Through this journey of Jesus in the Spirit, the Kingdom of God was inaugurated to renew the creation (Matt.12:28). Jesus bestowed the Spirit on the church from this experience of the Spirit in communion with the Father.

The Old Testament foresaw that the Messiah would be anointed by the Spirit (Isa. 61:1-3). Unprecedented was the idea that the Messiah would *bestow* the Spirit of God. Indeed, Christ's deity was revealed in his role as Bestower of the Spirit. Jesus as the man of the Spirit revealed his Lordship after the resurrection by breathing the Spirit upon the disciples (John 20:22), for only God can breathe forth the divine breath upon creation (Gen. 2:7). As St. Augustine noted concerning the Spirit, Jesus "received it as a man, he poured it out as God" (*De Trinitatis*

15:46). Jesus, as the Word of the Father and the resurrected Lord, exercised the divine right of pouring out the Spirit, an act that culminates in Luke's account of Pentecost (Acts 2:33). Indeed, "the first man, Adam, became a living being; the last Adam became a life-giving Spirit" (1 Cor. 15:45).

Jesus' anointing was unique in that it involved his incarnation as the divine Word of the Father. The church does not represent an extension of this incarnation in the world (as a *Christus prolongatus*). That assumption would only serve to deify the church. But the church does represent an extension of the anointing of Jesus in the world in the sense that the church is sanctified and empowered by the Spirit to expand and diversify Christ's charismatic ministry. Though Jesus' anointing is in a sense unique, it is also paradigmatic in its *charismatic specificity* for the church. Through the charismatic structure of the church, the church builds itself up in love as members help each other receive the grace of Christ that comes to us through gospel and sacrament. It also helps the church spread that grace to others.

In spreading grace to others, we walk the self-sacrificial path of the cross. Jesus poured out the Spirit not only from his risen life but from his crucified life as well. We thus cannot interpret Jesus' charismatic life, nor that of the church, in a triumphalistic way that neglects the path of the cross or the cost of discipleship. The charismatic life of Jesus was part of his proclamation of the year of the Lord's favor to the suffering of the world (Luke 4:18). Ripped from this christological setting, spiritual gifts can seem separated from the hope that the gifts inspire for those who suffer. The church in spiritual gifts must bear one another's burdens and seek solidarity with those who suffer everywhere, offering help and hope. Hope sometimes finds courage in a strength that is hidden and not affirmed by extraordinary signs. Moreover, there are ordinary gifts blessed by the Spirit along with extraordinary ones in the church. But extraordinary signs reveal that hidden strength can sometimes reach by God's grace for a visible foretaste of the victory to come in the new creation.

The point to be stressed here is that the christological foundation of the church is not only to be found in elements connected directly to the leadership of the clergy, such as church office, sacrament, or proclamation, but also in the church's vast charismatic structure. Poured forth from the loving communion of the Son with the Father, the Spirit establishes a communion that is diversely gifted and mutually edifying. Christ thus established the church

by pouring forth multiple gifts of the Spirit that are involved in the interactive fellowship and outward mission of the church. Ephesians 4:8 notes that after Christ's ascension he "gave gifts unto people" when pouring forth the Spirit. These gifts are not to be viewed as restricted to gifts of oversight, for Ephesians 4:16 then speaks of the church as building itself up in love by the "whole body, joined and held together by every supporting ligament." The christological founding of the church, therefore, cannot be understood apart from the church's broad charismatic structure.

Placed within the framework of the charismatic structure of the church, the ordained ministry in relation to preaching and sacraments can be explained in ways that avoid the problems that accompany clericalism, or an understanding of the church dominated by the clergy. The *koinonia* of the Spirit experienced in the interactive charismatic life of the church implies a mutually accountable and edifying ministry in the church involving all of the people of God. We will conclude with a reflection on preaching and sacrament in relation to the charismatic structure of the church.

PREACHING, SACRAMENT, AND THE CHARISMATIC STRUCTURE OF THE CHURCH

There is no way to overestimate the significance of preaching and Scripture in channeling God's grace to the church. The gospel of Jesus and the scriptural witness come to us through the very breath of God so that we may have the wisdom and the power to be saved through faith in Jesus Christ (2 Tim 3:15-16). The Scriptures are inspired, but not in the sense of representing a static deposit of revealed truths that we can systematize into idols of ink and paper. This fundamentalist illusion of Scripture as a static deposit can cause the church to presume that it has the final word on all of life's questions and challenges. There is no need under this modernist illusion to dialogue or to learn, to grow or to change. Following 2 Timothy 3:15-16, the Scriptures should be embraced as a living witness to Jesus Christ through the Spirit of God, inspiring ever-increasing faith in Jesus and granting us ongoing wisdom and power to serve one another and the world in Christ's name. As breathed by the

Spirit, the Scriptures are a living guide or measure of our worship and witness and not a static deposit to master and control according to our own self-serving ends.

Because of the living breath of God, the gospel of the Scriptures bursts forth with signs of life in the charismatic structure of the church. Spiritual gifts then help to keep the apostolic Word of the Scriptures alive and relevant within the ongoing gracious and gifted interactions of the people of God as they grow up into the full stature of Christ. Furthermore, spiritual gifts are always accountable to the living witness of the apostolic Word of the Scriptures as Paul clearly notes in his struggle with the pneumatically gifted members of the Corinthian congregation (1 Cor. 14:37). Within the charismatic structure of the church, the Spirit functions through the Scriptures as a living book of both freedom and order to guide our gracious interactions with one another. In fact, the Scriptures themselves are a universally relevant and binding gift of the Spirit to the church in order to guide the particular and diverse charismatic structure of the church in its ongoing life and mission.

My approach to Scripture might be regarded by some Evangelicals as dangerously vague. Some might see in my description of Scripture a fluid and imprecise understanding of how the Scriptures speak to us. Are there not truths clearly revealed in Scripture on which we can rely? Certainly. As Karl Barth reminds us, the revelation of God is *verbal* as well as personal. Many Evangelicals have misread Barth on this point. Barth did not deny that revelation through Scripture is verbal; he only denied that this verbal witness can be viewed as a static deposit to be mastered and placed at the disposal of our systems and ideologies. Notice what Barth states in the *Church Dogmatics*: "the personal character of God's Word means, not its deverbalizing, but the posing of an absolute barrier against reducing its wording to a human system."¹⁵ For Barth, God's placing divine revelation at our disposal in this way "would mean his allowing us to gain control over his Word, to fit it into our own designs, and thus to shut up ourselves against him to our own ruin."¹⁶

The Bible is verbally inspired and does contain truths that we confess and live by. But this text and its truths are living and active, constantly channeling the power and wisdom of the Spirit to us by the grace of God in diverse ways in the midst of gifted interactions among the people of God. Those ordained as leaders among us preach and teach the Word of God in a way that constantly places Christ and his biblical witness before us as the foundation of our gifted interactions and ministries. Yet, these leaders are also gifts among other gifted

members of the congregation, despite their public and overarching functions as ministers among us. They are accountable to us as we are to them. Ultimately, the canonical witness through the Spirit inspires, empowers, and guides us all in our gifted praise and service.

The charismatic structure of the church also serves to expand the field of the grace that comes to us in the gospel. Without this structure, preaching tends to become intellectualistic and abstract. In the Protestant focus on the Word of God, pneumatology has tended to be dominated by the exposition of the biblical text and the inward illumination of the text in the mind of the believer. This dominant emphasis on the *noetic* function of the Spirit has dogged Protestant theology from Calvin to Barth, requiring at least an implicit openness to the believer's participation in the full breadth of the Spirit's work. Part of the challenge of responding to Luther's universal priesthood of believers has been to expand it beyond household devotions so that it gains a prominent place in the mainstream of Protestant church life. The charismatic structure of the church can help us to do this.

What is needed is a pneumatology adequate to the task. More recent Protestant theologians have attempted to refer to the Spirit's work along the lines of a more holistic and transformational "new creation" motif in an effort to transcend the limitations of confining the work of the Spirit to the revelational and the *noetic*. A greater role for a diversity of *charismata* in our understanding of the ministry of the church to serve a multiplicity of needs will go far in enhancing this positive trend toward a more holistic pneumatology understood in the context of new creation.

In addition, the restriction of the Spirit's work to the realm of the *noetic* has tended to avoid or devalue the ecstatic and depth experiences of God in favor of the cognitive and the rational responses to the Word. Gordon Fee has expressed the view of many Pentecostals when remarking that, "contrary to the opinion of many, spiritual edification can take place in ways other than through the cortex of the brain."¹⁷ More of an emphasis on the gifts of the Spirit among all the people of God will allow for a broad spectrum of gifted activity that will involve the divine claim on the whole person, including the depths of the subconscious mind, the life of the body, and the disciplines of rational thinking.

We need to say something about the sacramental life of the church as well. By the power of the Spirit, the gospel is further proclaimed with sacramental signs of baptism and Lord's Supper. We participate in the grace of this gospel through baptism and eucharist. Because

Christ was baptized in solidarity with sinners, a solidarity that led him to the cross, we can now identify with Christ in his death and resurrection through baptism. Baptism is the ordination service of every Christian. The eucharist extends this participation in God's grace in the ongoing life of the Christian. The presence of the Lord at the Lord's table, however, is a *mutual presence* that involves a communion with him (and he in us) as well as a communion with one another. As Tom Driver has pointed out, we invoke the Spirit during this meal but we rarely take the time to feel the presence of the Spirit in interaction with one another.¹⁸

Again, the charismatic structure of the church expands the field of the receptivity of grace that comes to us in the Lord's Supper. In sacramental traditions, the temptation has been to objectify the grace of God in the giving of the sacrament, which resulted in a "ritual distancing of God" from the laity. More of an emphasis on the church's charismatic structure will open the sacraments up as wellsprings of a communal life that involve all the people of God as active participants. As Clark Pinnock stated so well,

As well as receiving the sacraments from the Spirit, we need to cultivate openness to the gifts of the Spirit. The Spirit is present beyond liturgy in a wider circle. There is a flowing that manifests itself as power to bear witness, heal the sick, prophesy, praise God enthusiastically, perform miracles and more. There is a liberty to celebrate, an ability to dream and see visions, a release of Easter life. There are impulses of power in the move of the Spirit to transform and commission disciples to become instruments of the mission.¹⁹

Also, as Karl Rahner has pointed out, the gifts of God's presence in the church can serve to "shock" the institutional life of the church and throw it back to the very core of its life in the presence of God, reminding it also that its existence and purposes are penultimate and relative to the coming Kingdom of God in power.²⁰

CONCLUSION: GRACE IN A GRACELESS WORLD

The charismatic structure of the church participates in the *koinonia* of God as Father, Son, and Spirit. Founded on Christ and filled with the Spirit, the charismatically diverse church reaches by the Spirit for this *koinonia* and seeks to open it up redemptively to the world. This *koinonia* involving diverse gifts provides the context in which the ordained clergy can lead

and guide the church into the mysteries of Christ through preaching and sacrament. The Spirit works through the gifts to help the church receive gospel and sacrament in diverse and relational ways that are specific, concrete, and contextual. This is finally the purpose of the charismatic structure of the church. The Spirit fills us in a way that enhances our unique reception of grace through preaching and sacrament so that we might variously help others be receptive as well. This is how we build one another up in God's love. May all things be done unto the diverse edification of the body of Christ so that the church can show forth signs of grace in an increasingly graceless world.

ENDNOTES

1. Christopher Lasch, *Haven in a Heartless World* (New York: Basic Books, 1977), 12-21.
2. Paul Tillich, *The Courage to Be* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2000).
3. This notion of the church giving forth signs of grace in an increasingly graceless world was used often in lectures and discussions by my doctoral mentor, Jan Lochman, at the University of Basel. More recently, Miroslav Volf has used this idea effectively in his, *Free of Charge: Giving and Forgiving in a Culture Stripped of Grace* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2006).
4. Martin Luther, *Lectures on the Romans*, trans. Wilhelm Pauck (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1961), 130.
5. Hans Küng, *The Church* (New York: Sheed & Ward, 1967). This concept is developed by Miroslav Volf, *After our Likeness: The Church as the Image of the Trinity* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans Pub. Co., 1997), esp. 231; and Veli-Matti Kärkkäinen, "Pentecostalism and the Claim for Apostolicity: An Essay in Ecumenical Ecclesiology," *Ecumenical Review of Theology* 25 (2001): 323-326.
6. Hans Küng, *The Church*, 184.
7. *Ibid*, 187.
8. *Ibid*, 188, italics his.
9. *Ibid*, 363. More recently, Miroslav Volf has developed this idea in his, *After our Likeness*, esp. 231.
10. John Koenig, *Charismata: God's Gifts for God's People* (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1978), 123.
11. Miroslav Volf, *After our Likeness*, esp. 195-199.
12. I am grateful to Michael Welker's, *God the Spirit* (Minneapolis: Augsburg Fortress, 1994) for the stress on the interactive, particularistic effect of the outpouring of the Spirit (e.g., 187).
13. See Michael Welker, *God the Spirit*, 148.
14. *Ibid*, 268-270.
15. Karl Barth, *Church Dogmatics*, Vol. I, Pt. 1, trans. G. W. Bromiley (Edinburgh: T & T Clark, 1975), 139.
16. *Ibid*.

Frank D. Macchia – Signs of Grace in a Graceless World

17. Gordon Fee, *God's Empowering Presence: The Holy Spirit in the Letters of Paul* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1994), 129.
18. Tom F. Driver, *The Magic of Ritual: Our Need for Liberating Rites that Transform Our Lives and Our Communities* (San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1991), 197-198.
19. Clark Pinnock, *Flame of Love: A Theology of the Holy Spirit* (Glen Ellyn, IL: Intervarsity Press, 1996), 129.
20. Karl Rahner, "Religious Enthusiasm and the Experience of Grace," *Theological Investigations*, Vol. XVI (New York: Seabury Press, 1979), 35-59.